
Yadi Supriadi1*, Asri Ainun Nisa1, Silvia Wulandari1
1Siliwangi University, Tasikmalaya, Indonesia
Email: supriadi24yadi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
Covid-19 pandemic has affected multifaceted aspects of life around the globe, including Indonesia. English language pedagogy is an obvious milieu suffered from this pandemic, notably English teachers. They should shift their beliefs from traditional to technological paradigm (e.g. online teaching). However, this paradigmatic shift generates challenges for their teaching practices. This study aimed at scrutinizing the paradigmatic shift of English teachers’ beliefs on the deployment of Technology-Enhanced Language Learning (TELL) during this pandemic. A descriptive case study was employed as a research design. There were four English teachers involved as participants. The findings implied that the teachers’ beliefs represent their teaching practices during this Covid-19 pandemic.

INTRODUCTION
Majority of people nowadays are undergoing a pandemic. On 31st of December, 2019, World Health Organization (WHO) reported officially a novel virus called 2019-nCoV. The pandemic began in Wuhan, Hubei, China and has caused severe problems to public health in most of the countries. The world has suffered from worldwide public health emergencies in the last 20 years caused by novel virus infections such as SARS-CoV1, MERS-CoV, HIV, Influenza A virus subtype H1N1, Influenza A virus subtype H5N1, and Ebola (Djalante, Lassa, Setiamarga, Mahfud, Sudjatma, Indrawan, Haryanto, Sinapoy, Rafliana, Djalante, and Gunawan, 2020). After several months, in Geneva, Switzerland, on 13th of February 2020, the virus was officially labelled as Corona Virus Disease-19 (Covid-19) (Zhang, Yu, Xu, Lei, Pu, Dai, Lin, Wang, Wu, Liu, Li, 2020).

Some countries’ economy have been affected by this Covid-19 pandemic. The Covid-19 scourge adversely influences worldwide exchange and social life. In particular, the travel
industry, exchange wares, creation and transportation areas have begun to be adversely influenced by this pestilence (Zeren and Hizarci, 2020). Strip malls revealed drop in footfall by up to 30% in the US starting on 18 March 2020 (Santos, 2020, March 23). Workman (2020) finds that China encounters a huge decrease in shipments of nearly all classes of merchandise including electrical hardware, apparatus, furniture, lighting, plastic things, vehicles, weave, apparel, adornments, optical, technical, medical appliances and natural synthetic substances. The US economy is worried about the increasing macroeconomic vulnerability, while confronting a lower interest for US fares to China (Piven, 2020). Wei and Wang and Verbraken (2020) state that New Zealand faces an enormous number of retractions of their fares to China of various items including wood, fish, and meat because of the pandemic.

In educational sector, numerous nations having universal advanced education as a key supporter of their economy are set to see huge stuns, as they force harsher limitations or bans on international arrivals. The US, the UK, and Australia may discover zero appearances of global students during the pandemic and significantly less in months after the pandemic recuperation (Barua, 2020). At the moment, Egypt has shut schools, colleges, and other educational foundations (Ahram, 2020). This closure influences a huge number of students. Notable private colleges have found a way to do their instruction online during the time of campuses closure. In Australia, A few colleges started with cautious cleaning of campuses after some students’ tests of Covid-19 were positive. In Germany, On 12 March, face-to-face instruction was suspended and after one day, college staff could work from home (Crawford, Butler-Henderson, Rudolph, Glowatz, 2020). Then, On 18 March, assessments were declared to be restricted to a flat minimum, and oral assessments were suspended. In Italy, schools, open events, and religious events were shut in red and yellow zones, with the closure of all business actions and all school closures across the nation to follow. The Italian Minister of University and Research reported that colleges' online activities would be conveyed beginning from 2 March and graduations would be done with Skype (De Giorgio, 2020). Those are some countries that temporarily are suffering from this Covid-19 Pandemic in educational setting.

Among many countries that have been infected by Covid-19, Indonesia is one of the countries that is suffering from this condition. On 29th of July 2020, there are 46 thousand confirmed cases and more than 2500 deaths caused by Covid-19. Since Indonesia’s economic growth relies on ‘highly consumption’ and ‘the tourism business’, this pandemic aggravates economic growth in Indonesia (Naryono, 2020, p. 2). Apart from that, in terms of education, Rosser (2018) claimed that Indonesian educators possess lack of required content knowledge and pedagogical knowledge to be competent educators; students’ learning achievements are poor; and the specialization of graduates and the needs of employers are disparate. Further, Nurkholis (2020) stated in educational sector, around 370 million students are not allowed to attend school due to temporary closure. Furthermore, President of Indonesia, Jokowi Widodo said that this new policy would make the schools more creative on using technology as a medium of instruction and Minister of Education and Culture, Nadiem Makariem also supported the statement that it is time to innovate and conduct various trials in learning (Setkab, 2020).

It can be seen that the use of technology plays an important part during this pandemic, since there are some countries which have implemented online learning. Mishra and Koehler (2006) introduced a framework called Technological, Pedagogical, and Content Knowledge (TPACK). This framework was developed from Pedagogical Content Knowledge (PCK) by
Shulman (1986). The purpose of this framework is to better integrate technology, pedagogy, and content. In Thailand, one of the problems teachers face is lacking their technological skills and their incapabilities of integrating technology into the instruction methods (Nomnian and Arphattananon, 2018a, b; Ruangrong, Jirawongphong, Manyum, Somyarone, Muendetch, and Srisurat, 2014). Another study conducted by Mahaye (2020) revealed that in South Africa where people who live in rural area were benefited from blended learning due to lack of technological skills and some basic technological tools. Besides, India has the same issue which is the nature of instruction in rural skills is terrible. Educators in rural territories may confront some difficulties, for example, lacking of technological skills training, technological exposure, apprehension of new methods of instructing (Srivastava, Singh, and Singh, 2020). Thus, it can be concluded that some teachers are still not able to fulfill the TPACK framework as they face some challenges in only incorporating technology into the classroom. During the pandemic, Wang, Cheng, Yue, and McAleer (2020) wrote that teachers who are accustomed to face-to-face classes will be required to adapt to new approaches in their teaching, which might impact the quality of education. Moreover, Putri, Purwanto, Pramono, Asbari, Wijayanti, and Hyun (2020) found that teachers face more challenges such as selecting learning methods, having insufficient curriculum material, and also lacking technological skills. A Further study was conducted by Purwanto, Pramono, Asbari, Hyun, Wijayanti, and Putri (2020) in Indonesia which revealed that teachers also encountered some challenges such as possessing a lack of technological abilities and managing their office hours since they currently need stay connected and coordinated with other teachers, headmaster, and students’ parents. However, Mantra and Widiastuti (2020) conducted a research in the form of a teacher training program to improve their technological skills and the result of their study showed that the teachers gave positive responses towards the program.

As noted above, there has been a plethora of studies revealing that technology becomes a positive breakthrough in the development of teaching and learning. On the other hand, there are still some negative perceptions about the use of technology as a challenge for teachers. Most researchers focused on the advantages and disadvantages, while there are still lack of studies focusing on what their teaching beliefs are during this pandemic and how their beliefs are shifted due to this condition. Therefore, researchers are interested in conducting a case study to delineate what the teachers’ beliefs are on TELL during Covid-19. Also, this research focuses on finding how their beliefs influence their teaching performances in the teaching process.

**METHODOLOGY**

The research method used in this research is qualitative research with a descriptive case study approach. According to Yin (2003), a descriptive case study is a study approach to discover relatively new phenomena because of its early stage based on the existing body of knowledge. Moreover, This research was conducted in Tasikmalaya, West Java. The research subjects for this qualitative study are in-service teachers. The number of teachers involved in the study is four teachers who have officially taught at four different schools.

In analyzing the data, researchers utilized the Thematic Analysis (TA) in which one of the advantages of thematic analysis is its flexibility. There are six steps that can be followed as stated by Braun and Clarke (2006). (1) **Familiarizing the Data**, the researchers familiarized and partook themselves with the gathered information frequently. (2) **Generating Initial Codes**, helped the researchers to generate starting codes from the examined information by positing activities to assess the information. (3) **Searching for Themes**, guided the analysts to chracterise and deal with the important data to specific themes. Then, reviewing themes. (4)
Reviewing Potential Themes, encouraged the researchers to survey the thematic information to decide a dependable, related, and thematic formulas attached to the research questions. Next, defining and naming themes. (5) Defining and Naming Themes, comprised the analysts’ activities in building up the fine-grained themes of information connected with the investigative scope and focus. (6) Producing the Research,

The data were analyzed by utilizing the framework for the analysis of teaching practices and beliefs. Further, this framework was published by Dubuc (2009) in the Teaching and Learning International Survey (TALIS)’ results under the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). This study’s interests in describing the teachers’ paradigmatic shifts on the implementation of TELL during Covid-19 pandemic can be addressed by focusing on every single point of the framework.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The researchers deployed this framework so that we can get a sense of teachers’ beliefs of what they did before and were doing during the Covid-19 pandemic. The participants were interviewed based on the abovementioned framework so that it can be identified either each participant’s response of every single theme is relevant or irrelevant. In order to seek the relevancy of each participant’s response, researchers made a table divided into some tables as follows.

Challenges in Teachers’ Professional Competence during Covid-19

The Instructional process relies on what the instructor carries to the classroom. In classroom and school practices, professional competence is perceived as an essential factor (Shulman, 1987; Kelchtermans & Ballet, 2002; Campbell, McNamara, and Gilroy, 2004; Baumert and Kunter, 2006; Dubuc, 2009; Tang, Wong, and Cheng, 2016).

Table 1. The Extracts of Challenges in Teachers’ Professional Competence during Covid-19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>Although the technology is supporting, but still the main benchmark is how they understand the learning process...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>Because the obstacle is not in me who can not deal with technology, but the obstacle is in the students…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>… happened actually faced more obstacles, it could not be maximized because it might not be ready for preparation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #4</td>
<td>… yes for online learning there is no strong engagement like offline learning…</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During the Covid-19, ELT teachers are facing some challenges that require them to adapt to a new teaching environment. They perceived that they were shocked by the sudden regulation and made them difficult in ensuring the students’ understanding of the delivered lessons. In short, all of them said that these days teaching has many challenges, although they know that technology can help them continue the teaching process.

Student-centredness as Teachers’ Beliefs and Attitudes during Covid-19

The professional competence covers two main aspects which are (1) The direct transmission occurs when teachers determine what will be discussed and learned in the classroom (Pressley, Roehrig, Raphael, Dolezal, Bohn, Mohan, and Hogan, 2003).
Meanwhile, (2) the constructivist beliefs focus on students as active learners. In these beliefs, Staub and Stern (2002) stated the enhancement of students’ thinking and reasoning processes is emphasized more than gaining a specific knowledge.

**Table 2. The Extracts of Student-centeredness as Teachers’ Beliefs and Attitudes during Covid-19**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>…limited, for now discovery learning is still used, but its scope is wider…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>…maybe the student centered is more effective,…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>…may be more to student, more active to the students…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #4</td>
<td>…just for the assignment there is no other method.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since teachers must stay in touch with their students and continue the learning process, they become a constructivist educator in which students will be more active learners, but the current situation does not allow them to interact more with the students as in the classroom. Teachers found it challenging in ensuring students’ activities using technology. In fact, most of the time all ELT teachers were doubtful and not confident with the students’ learning outcomes. Another demand for teachers who were used to direct transmission before the pandemic, these days, they need to adapt to a new perspective of teaching.

**Teachers’ Setbacks in Classroom Practice during Covid-19**

The classroom practice is central in generating a positive learning experience for students. It includes two main aspects which are classroom management and classroom interaction. Effective classroom management is central because it builds and maintains an organized environment in the classroom (Obi, 2020). Apart from this, classroom interaction is considered to be fundamental because learning is not just about what students possess or not, rather it is what the students participate in and it involves interaction with others (Valentika and Ariyanto, 2020). Besides, Dubuc (2009) wrote there are three elements of a classroom teaching practice. (1) structuring practices (2) student-oriented practices (3) enhanced activities.

**Table 3. The Extracts of Teachers' Setbacks in Classroom Practice during Covid-19**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>they are required to make their own videos of English speech videos and…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>…there were two tasks there, they…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>…Many students also complained that teachers gave many assignments…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #4</td>
<td>…Yes, there were more assignments like that because nothing else that can be maximized while online…</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There have been many alterations and challenges for the ELT teachers during this pandemic, particularly in terms of their methodology of teaching. All of the teachers possessed a tendency that they depended on giving students personal tasks which were able to burden and potentially cause learning burnout. They were unprepared with this situation and dealing with students virtually was a novelty for them. The teachers felt that face-to-face instruction was preferable than delivering lessons virtually because they were not confident with the result of the learning outcomes.

**Professional Collaboration as Teachers’ Activities during Covid-19**
In teaching, they are required to maintain the relationship and to cooperate among other staffs in order to develop educational processes and outcomes. Teachers are able to trust each other and cooperate to develop, to withstand, and to move toward the effectiveness of the organization (Ghasemiyan and Jafari, 2019). Moreover, cooperation among colleagues provides opportunities for social and emotional support, exchange of ideas, and practical advice. Oder and Eischenschmidt (2016) suggest that joint creativity, mutual values, and vision, as well as supporting teaching performance conditions, covering common individual practices, help teachers to engage in the decision-making process at school. Therefore, it can be considered that teachers’ collaborative relationships are a central factor for teachers’ professionalism (Oder and Eischenschmidt, 2016).

Table 4. The Extracts of Professional Collaboration as Teachers' Activities during Covid-19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>…so we discussed the material that we…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>…, we often have a discussion especially…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>Yes, I have a lot of discussions,…</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ELT teachers’ collaboration and coordination were shifted due to this condition. The teachers needed to interact with other English teachers in an online setting instead of face-to-face discussion. Maintaining communication is central for teachers since they needed to communicate such issues or teaching ideas during this pandemic condition.

Flexibility and Revision in Lesson Timing at Classroom Level Environment during Covid-19

The classroom environment is where the learning process takes place. According to Fraser (1996) point out that this concerns the student cohesiveness, teacher support, student participation, investigation, task orientation, cooperation, and equity. Further, a nurturing classroom environment is fundamental in supporting the students emotionally and socially. This will strengthen students’ motivation and build their confidence to gain self-actualization (Aguilar, 2020).

Table 5. The Extracts of Flexibility and Revision in Lesson Timing at Classroom Level Environment during Covid-19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>Alhamdulillah, I did not find any problems with lack of hours, so…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>…, when the RPP online, it was overhauled again…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>…, I made the changes to the RPP again,…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #4</td>
<td>…during the pandemic, there is no lesson plan, only…</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When the governmental regulation was implemented, the learning for the students stay interactive in an online setting. This impacted how teachers should manage the lesson plan, they must revise the lesson planning and all ELT teachers perceived that during this pandemic, when it comes to timing in the lesson plan, it was more flexible than before the pandemic. They believe the only way to gain effective teaching during this condition is relying on personal assignments and implementing the discovery learning.
The School Policy and Teacher-student Relation at School Level Environment during Covid-19

School-level environment refers to “the climate, culture, resources, and social networks of a school” (Loukas & Murphy, 2007, p.293). Some recent studies found that a powerful association between elements of school-level environment and teachers’ outcomes such as teaching efficacy, teacher stress, and job satisfaction (Fisher & Fraser, 1990; Collie, Shapka, and Perry, 2012).

Table 6. The Extracts of The School Policy and Teacher-student Relation at School Level Environment during Covid-19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>…, so there is less interaction with students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>…the homework are also like only a few,…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>…one class there was 1 person who was already very difficult to lose contact.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #4</td>
<td>I personally do not feel the massive improvement with that policy.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Given this condition, teacher-student interaction was drastically changed due to students’ lack of responses. The teacher found that having a virtual classroom could not be as effective as it was in the classroom. They simply were not able to monitor or ensure what really happened to students that they were not active during the class. Moreover, the school policy is perceived as an influential factor for them in ELT.

Working on Demands and Unsatisfied Learning Outcomes as the Overall Job-related Teachers' Attitudes during Covid-19

Self-efficacy and job satisfaction are the cornerstone of all the elements. Some studies revealed that students’ greater learning achievement and aspirations are supported when teachers have lower perceived stress and greater perceived teaching efficacy and job satisfaction (Tran, 2015). Job satisfaction is related to “the degree to which teachers’ job-related needs such as fulfillment, gratification, recognition for accomplishments, and satisfaction are being met” (Evans, 1997, p. 149). Additionally, teachers’ job satisfaction is measured by their teaching efficacy and stress (Caprara, Barbaranelli, Borgogni, and Steca, 2003; Collie, Shapka, and Perry, 2011; Tran, 2015), and both stress and teaching efficacy influenced job satisfaction (Klassen & Chiu, 2010; Tran, 2015).

Table 7. The Extracts of Working on Demands and Unsatisfied Learning Outcomes as the Overall Job-related Teachers' Attitudes during Covid-19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Extracts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #1</td>
<td>Then, we are forced to have online learning and…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #2</td>
<td>Yes, the demands must all be online,…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #3</td>
<td>because maybe the conditions that demand us to be like this…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher #4</td>
<td>…but if we do so online, we don’t know whether the response of children is positive or not.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result of ELT during this pandemic causes dissatisfaction for the ELT teachers. They did not feel that this pandemic as an effective way of teaching. This can be seen in how teachers were stressed and not confident with the students’ learning outcomes. Furthermore,
it remains a fact that they work on the demands of a new policy and forcefully to adapt to the current condition.

CONCLUSION

In this study, the researchers focused on some issues regarding the paradigmatic shift of English teachers’ beliefs on the spread of TELL during this Covid-19 pandemic. Teachers’ beliefs are related to some other teaching elements which interact with each other in teaching-learning processes. What the teachers believe may cause what they conduct during the class, particularly during this condition. It also influences teaching methodology, attitudes, and teaching practices. This study revealed that most of the EFL teachers’ paradigm on TELL was changed. Their whole perception of the use of technology during this pandemic was unsatisfied. They preferred to have a face-face interaction rather than online interaction. Additionally, the main unsatisfaction for the EFL teachers were the students’ learning achievements. Adapting to virtual learning was demanding for them because they were not able to do anything with the governmental policy and this pandemic condition.

The motivation for this study is to investigate what and how the EFL teachers’ beliefs are during this Covid-19 pandemic. Although the result shown that most of teachers are facing challenges during this condition. There are still some future study needed to strengthen this research in other fields of study. Besides, the limited number of participants of this case study cannot be generalized and applicable in other areas. Thus, this study can be a starting point for future work.

REFERENCES


Yadi et al: English Teachers’ Beliefs on Technology Enhanced ... ____________ 57


